

Guidelines for Manuscript Reviewers Humboldt Journal of Social Relations

- Do set yourself a specific amount of time for reading the paper (e.g. 60-75 minutes)
- Do set yourself a specific amount of time for rereading, thinking, and writing comments (e.g. 60-90 minutes)
- Do spend the first paragraph of the review focusing on a very brief summary of the paper and the overall strengths and contributions. At very least, the author(s) should feel certain that you understand their work
- Do include your assessment, when applicable, of these aspects of traditional research papers: originality, literature review currency, sufficiency and fit, methodological appropriateness, soundness and sophistication of data analysis, significance of the research contribution, overall paper organization, grammar and clarity.
- Be principled, fair and generous with praise when warranted.
- Do be specific, but not overly picky. This helps both the editor and the author(s) with direction for change.
- Do consider the information in tables, graphs, charts, and endnotes. Feel free to suggest if any material should be moved into the text or from the text to tables or endnotes.
- Do not edit, copy edit, or rewrite the manuscript yourself. If there are numerous grammatical, spelling, or writing problems, say so and provide a few examples. It is not necessary to supply line-by-line corrections in a review.
- Do not attack the author(s) for not writing the paper that you would have written.
- Do not identify yourself in the review or try to figure out who wrote the manuscript. Your review should not be based on who you think or know wrote it.
- Do not make recommendations (reject, accept, revise and resubmit) in the review narrative itself. These comments should be made only to the editors and are advisory. Do not agonize over these recommendations. It is OK to reject a paper with an original idea but a poor execution, or a well-written and researched paper that does not offer anything new to the topic under study.
- Do not distribute or cite the manuscript: it is considered a confidential document.